High Level Multistakeholder Committee HLMC

Meeting minutes
Date/time: February 24th, 2014 17:30~19:00
Place: GSMA, Barcelona, Spain

Participants:
HLMC Chairman: Paulo Bernardo Silva
NETmundial Chairman: Virgilio Almeida
European Commission: Neelie Kroes
Argentina: Juan Cruz Gonzalez Allonca
France: David Martinon
Germany: Dirk Brengelmann
Ghana: Edward Omane Boamah
South Africa: Yunus Carrim
Spain (HLMC meeting host country): D. Víctor Calvo-Sotelo
Tunisia: Tawfik Jelassi
Turkey: Emir Salim Yüksel
USA: Daniel Sepulveda
International Organizations (ITU): Fabio Leite
Civil Society: Louis Pouzin
Technical Community: Mathieu Weill
Technical Community: Tarek Kamel
Technical Community: Walda Roseman (representing Kathy Brown)
Private Sector: Christoph Steck

Remote connection:
Academia: David Johnson
International Organizations (UNDESA): Elia Armstrong (representing Wu Hongbo)
Private Sector: Jimson Olufuye
Private Sector: Joseph Alhadeff
Civil Society: Jovan Kurbalija
Civil Society: Stephanie Perrin
Technical Community: Kathy Brown

Supporting personnel:
Brazilian Ministry of Communications: Flavio Lenz, Maximiliano Martinhao, Alessandra Cardoso
European Commission: Pearse O`Donohue
Argentina: Anabel Cisneros
Ghana: Issah Yahaya
Spain: D. Juan Corro
Tunisia: Mohamed Ben Amor
NETmundial Secretariat: Daniel Fink, Fabrizio Leonardo
Consulate of Brazil in Barcelona: Michel Laham

Agenda:
1. Welcome message and Introduction of Participants (5 min)
2. Initial remarks (15 min)
   - H.E. Neelie Kroes - Vice President of European Commission for the Digital Agenda
   - D. Víctor Calvo-Sotelo - Secretary of State for Telecommunications and Information Society of Spain (Special Invitee)
   - Minister Paulo Bernardo - Minister of Communications of Brazil
3. Briefing and Introduction of the NETmundial structure and workflow (Secretary Virgílio Almeida) (10 min)
   a. Background
   b. Objectives and expected outcomes
   c. Committees and interactions among them
   d. Content contribution process
   e. Synthesis paper and document drafting
   f. Important dates
   g. HLMC roles and Agenda
4. Open Floor & Discussion (40 min)
5. Summary and Closing Remarks (20 min)

Initial remarks:

NETmundial High Level Multistakeholder Committee (HLMC) Chairman, Mr. Paulo Bernardo Silva, opened the meeting thanking the presence of all members. He mentioned that it was a challenging task to bring together such a group and the GSMA event became an appropriate venue to gather a significant amount of participants.

He also appreciated the support of HLMC members for accepting the role in contributing to the organization of NETmundial. He explained that NETmundial is a global multistakeholder meeting about the future of internet governance (IG) and aims to reach consensus about universally accepted IG principles and further evolution of the internet governance ecosystem.

The quality of the ideas during the event and contributions for the final documents will directly depend on the diversity of participations. In this sense, the NETmundial HLMC has one of the most important missions, which is promote the participation of the international community. In this sense, he invited all members to engage each one of its respective communities. He also understands that HLMC have the responsibility of reviewing the draft documents to be proposed during the event.

Chairman Paulo Bernardo emphasized that NETmundial is a short event, only 2 days, recommending a joint effort to produce a document with very positive outcomes. He remembered that this is not a simple task, since the intention is to build this document from the contributions and acceptance of all interested parties.

He concluded saying that the internet is a fundamental tool for the global society and his expectation is to have a meeting in the level of its importance. It should reflect the trust deposited by the involved people, organizations and governments.

Briefing and Introduction of NETmundial

NETmundial Chairman, Virgilio Almeida, thanked the attendance of participants and described the organization of the meeting and the role of each committee in the process of

document drafting to be discussed in the two days conference. He confirmed NETmundial venue as the Grand Hyatt Hotel in Sao Paulo from April 23rd to 24th. Venue capacity of 800 participants.

He explained the context of NETmundial based in two important events: First was the speech of Brazilian President Dilma Rousseff in the United Nations, calling for new IG mechanisms and structures, proposed the discussion of principles such as freedom of expression, privacy, respect for human rights and the construction of an inclusive and non-discriminatory society. Second, the meeting between the Brazilian President and Mr. Fadi Chehade from ICANN where it was discussed the possibility of preparing a conference in Brazil. Since then, NETmundial in being organized by a collaboration between the Brazilian Internet Steering Committee (CGI.br) and several international organizations, such as /1Net and others.

Virgilio Almeida described the mission given by Brazilian President as to organize and execute the conference in a multistakeholder way. Therefore, the work is concentrated in having a multistakeholder event to discuss IG principles and mechanisms. The two main themes for NETmundial are: internet governance principles accepted by different stakeholders involved in the conference; Roadmap for the further evolution of the Internet governance ecosystem including concrete the steps. He observed that NETmundial is supposed to be the beginning of a series of discussions (a first step) and shall be continued in other conferences.

In order to fulfill the multistakeholder way of organizing NETmundial, several meetings were conducted to establish an organizational structure. Hence, 5 committees were created: HLMC, NETmundial Board, Executive Multistakeholder Committee (EMC), Logistics and Organizational Committee (LOC) and the Council for Governmental Advisors.

The HLMC is responsible for setting the political tone of the meeting and providing global visibility. HLMC is chaired by Minister Paulo Bernardo, 12 countries invited to Co-host the meeting (South Africa, Germany, Argentina, European Commission, South Korea, USA, France, Ghana, india, Indonesia, Tunisia and Turkey). In addition, taking into account the multistakeholder organizing way, 12 members from Civil Society, Private Sector, Academia, Technical Community and 2 members from International Organizations complete the HLMC group.

The NETmundial Board is responsible for overseeing the organization of the meeting and have 4 co-chairs: Jeanette Hofmann (Academia), Fadi Chehade (Technical Community), Andile Ngcaba (Private Sector) and Subi Chaturvedi (Civil Society). The composition of the board intended to reach gender and geographical representation.

The EMC is working on the preparations of basic documents that we will be discussed in the two days. Co-chairs are Demi Getschko and Raul Echeberria. Several names from Academia, Private Sector, Civil Society and Technical Community integrate the committee. EMC is working in contributions and their goal is to have the reference documents by mid-march.

The LOC is co-chaired by Hartmut Glaser and Nick Tomasso. The committee is taking actions to have the conference ready for April 23rd and 24th including remote participation and translations available in 7 languages (6 UN official languages + Portuguese).

A frequent question is about the role of the HLMC. The Chairman explained that the HLMC primarily responsible for setting the political tone and providing international visibility to NETmundial. The practical aspects of this responsibility are the capacity to review the documents prepared by EMC, provide feedback with suggestions and return them NETmundial Board. NETmundial Board will interact directly with the EMC to achieve a final version of these documents by the beginning of the conference. During the meeting, the HLMC and the Chairs of NETmundial will seek approval for the final documents. Given that it is a two days conference, it will be important to have an accepted document by different multistakeholders with some concrete suggestions for the IG ecosystem.

Expressions of Interest for participation in the NETmundial website are open during February. So far, 433 Expressions of Interest were received until Feb 24th. A graph was shown describing the multistakeholder characteristic by groups and by geographic regions.

Content contributions from groups or communities (companies, individuals, NGO's, etc.) can be submitted until March 8th. Governments can send contributions directly to the email address of the Brazilian Foreign Office, Ministry of External Relations to the email netmundial@itamaraty.gov.br. The contributions will be synthesized in the second half of March and there will be some interactions between the EMC and HLMC. This will be coordinated by the NETmundial Board.

Remote connection will be available for any individual connected to the internet and remote hubs with direct interaction with NETmundial will be available in 15 locations around the world. The outcomes of the conference are a set of principles and next steps to improve IG ecosystem.

Remarks from H.E. Neelie Kroes - Vice President of European Commission for the Digital Agenda

H.E. Neelie Kroes appreciated the opportunity of the meeting thanking the Brazilian Government for the initiative. She expressed that the next two years will be absolutely critical in redrawing the global map of the IG and the choices to global leaders are to be successful or really to be blamed. Her expectation for NETmundial meeting in Brazil will be an important step forward, congratulating the initiative from the Brazilian President and offering her personal participation and contribution underlying that it was extremely important. She emphasized that do not want to witness another talk show and it should be crystal clear that outputs should be focused on IG principles and roadmap.

Regarding the roadmap, there should be actionable and agreeable milestones involved. She mentioned the recent European Commission communication regarding internet governance policies and the role of Europe role in shaping the future of the internet and noted the experienced difficulties and need to constantly keep the focus on what's in the stake given the short timeframe.

Citing the Brazilian President speech at UN, H.E. Neelie Kroes thinks that a meaningful result is owed, believing that other EC members would agree on the need to be very precise and to deliver clear political statements.

She clarified that Europe would not make connections between surveillance practices and the debate on internet governance. However, it is also necessary to keep in mind some realities such as the recent trust issues in the global internet, including its technical infrastructure and its governance. More than awareness, an answer should be also be in place considering real political and legal risks that could ultimately lead to a technical fragmentation of the global internet. That should be avoided. In order to do that, a credible evolutionary path for a sustainable evolution of the internet should be put forward. EC policy statement responds to that needs and it's based on 4 core points: 1. European approach should be a middle way. Neither politicization, nationalization or denying authorities. It should enhance inclusiveness by engaging all countries in the multistakeholder context, an approach where everybody is asked to be involved and have clearly defined roles for public authorities and stakeholders in the IG. 2) Strengthen the multistakeholder model of IG making actors and processes more inclusive, more transparent and more accountable and certainly its right time to move towards of real globalization of key internet functions. It should include a clear timeline to globalize ICANN and IANA functions and must be done while safeguarding the stability, security and resilience of the internet. 3. Work towards a coherent set of internet principles with safeguards on open, unfragmented internet with full respect for human rights.

H.E. Neelie Kroes concluded saying that, for the EC, a top down approach is not the right answer and are not calling new legal instruments. Also is it not the intention to shift towards pure

intergovernmental processes and the EC is very open to dialogue and discussion. She advised that time is running out, citizens are expecting that leaders deal with this issue in a proper way: quick, open and transparent.

Remarks from D. Víctor Calvo-Sotelo - Secretary of State, Spain
Thank to Minister Paulo Bernardo for the invitation. Spanish government will put all his effort in helping the Brazilian government and this committee to do his job.

Open Floor & Discussion
Germany: Ambassador Dirk Brengelmann
        Thanked the Brazilian government and all initiatives. Also thanked ICANN for the good role of getting the process going. Spoke on behalf of the German Foreign Ministry, remembering that a representative from the Ministry of Economy would join him in future discussions.
        Ambassador Brengelmann mentioned that it will not be easy to set up the described documents (Principles and Roadmap). He pointed that the word ecosystem is frequently used and was not quite sure about what roadmap or ecosystem could be. He asked for more information about activities taken by EMC to foster conclusions, decisions and consensus in the very critical period where it is supposed to put together the synthesis. It was requested an early circulation of the synthesis around March, remembering the multistakeholder system advised by Brazilian President where all the players need to be involved. He also asked the NETmundial secretariat to share the contribution from Germany in the website.
        One of the principles that Germany included in its contribution has to do with privacy issue following up on the Brazil-German talks related to privacies. It was also included some indications of the role of multistakeholders in the future process. He also observes some alignment among the EC, French and USA contributions and a good perspective to engage in substance.

South Africa: Minister Yunus Carrim
        Minister Yunus Carrim thanked and welcomes the invitation to join NETmundial. He expressed surprise for being lately informed of the inclusion of South Africa in the HLMC, justifying that his international affairs official was also not well informed. He noted the appointment of a business person from South Africa as committee member, mentioning that he is very respected and former director general in his ministry and asked for clarification of his role in the conference. He advised to refer to him as an individual from South Africa since he does not speak on behalf of the government. Chairman Virgilio Almeida explained that he is representing the Private Sector, not the government.
        Minister Carrim informed that NETmundial comes in the eve of elections by May 2nd, an it would be unlikely an attendance at ministerial level. He ensured that senior officials will be in Sao Paulo.

Tunisia: Minister Tawfik Jelassi
        Minister Tawfik Jelassi informed that he took the office 3 weeks ago and it's getting acquainted with NETmundial processes. He noted that Tunisia is one of African countries to participate in the HLMC and thanked Brazil for the willingness to host the meeting. He assured that Tunisia will do it most to help to prepare the meeting and meet the objectives mentioned by Commissioner Kroes. He echoed the advice for avoiding another talk show, proposing the adoption of concrete actions and contributions that are meaningful to help boost ICT and internet as major

enabler for socioeconomic development taking into account the truly multistakeholder approach. He concluded looking forward to work and meet HLMC again in Brazil.

Ghana: Minister Edward Omane Boamah

Minister Boamah expressed that NETmundial is a really ambitious initiative almost attempting to the impossibility. Nevertheless, the human race has always confronted challenges so this will obviously not be the last challenge that we attempt to overcome. On behalf of Ghana, the Minister expressed his willingness to participate and to contribute, also providing the necessary help in terms of mobilizing Ghana's sister countries.

He informed that his government will submit our contributions on mechanisms for the sustainable governance of the internet as well as democratic principles. He added that the President of Ghana is a former Minister of Communications and brought his willingness to participate in the process. It was advised that the short duration of NETmundial (2 days) should not be a stumbling block to obtain concrete goals, since committee members coming from business community, ICANN and others are working very hard towards a future in Brazil. Respecting these efforts, even if a micro step is achieved, it should be a positive move, keeping in mind that the short period would restrain more ambitious outcomes.

France: David Martinon, Special Representative for international negotiations on the Information Society and the Digital Economy

The representative from France informed the participation in ministerial level for NETmundial. He informed his alignment following the talks from European Commission and Germany to strengthen the multistakeholder model in Sao Paulo. He welcomed the words of Chairman Virgilio Almeida about the idea of having NETmundial as the beginning of a series of meetings. The submission of content contribution from France is confirmed and will be focused in the roadmap and on the principles, also including data privacy. He also welcomed the resolution adopted by the ICANN board from the previous week.

The French contribution to NETmundial is under a consulting process in order to build a consensus before the submission. France agrees that ICANN issue should not be the main topic of the Sao Paulo meeting, but decisions are still to be taken in the way forward. He concluded expressing his pride for working together with 2 other French members in the HLMC, including one of the founding fathers of the internet.

ITU: Fabio Leite

Mr. Fabio Leite informed that ITU is very honored to have been appointed by the UN Secretary General to represent the UN system alongside with DESA in the HLMC. He took the opportunity to welcome Brazil's timely efforts to facilitate a global dialogue on the important matters of NETmundial and look forward to transparent, open, constructive and meaningful discussions that are inclusive to all nations and stakeholders with a view of ensuring a better internet for all.

Chairman Virgilio Almeida

Informed that the Brazilian Government is also working in a document to be submitted to the consideration of the conference. The contribution is being prepared under the coordination of the chief of staff of the President to represent the official Brazilian position as one of the countries involved in the conference.

USA: Ambassador Daniel Sepulveda

Ambassador Sepulveda informed that USG made a submission on Friday (Feb 21st) and at the core of this submission is first to achieve what you want to achieve all have to present some degree of flexibility and agree that the process is very cooperative in good will. He affirmed that there are two important caveats that, one, as stated, the meeting is organized and executed in a multistakeholder fashion and its outcomes should reflect the commitment to that process. Strengthening all the multistakeholder process ensuring that its fully inclusive and respected by all participants.

Moving forward, US will take extreme interest in the process for seeking a pool of concrete suggestions. For that to be successful there should be some mechanism where consensus has been reached. Even if we do achieve consensus in a small group of principles that does not mean that are not other good principles that we should consider over time. So US believe that there should be some limit of goals for what can be achievable in the time frame.

Technical Community: Tarek Kamel, ICANN

Mr. Tarek Kamel thanked the President and leadership of Brazil for organizing NETmundial, mobilizing the world and the internet community. Noting that NETmundial is a truly multistakeholder conference organized and executed for the first time in the internet community outside the UN, he advised that is very important to have a strong and high level attendance to provide legitimacy to the event and to the process and more efforts should be devoted by each HLMC member on this direction. He expressed concern about the comment from the South African Government representative regarding the late knowledge about the invitation to be a co-organizer.

He invited all members to jointly plan and, as a technical community representative, colleagues could have outreach to engage the right people on the right level. Level should be more important than numbers provide legitimacy and importance to the multistakeholder process.

The second point mentioned was the ICANN Board decision to support the CEO for the ICANN globalization process. Although this is not the main topic for Sao Paulo, it will definitely help to push the dialogue forward in terms of principles and global ecosystem. He echoed Chairman Virgilio's words that NETmundial is not a destination, but the beginning of a process so high expectations should not be stimulated. As first steps in the process, a clear roadmap and guidelines should be agreed with follow up steps ahead.

In his conclusion, Mr. Tarek Kamel asked about clarifications in the process of producing a document after the end of parallel sessions in NETmundial, more specifically, what is the plan for synthetizing all inputs that will result in the communique.

Technical Community: Valda Roseman, ISOC

Mrs. Valda Roseman attended the meeting representing Mrs. Kris Brown. Mrs. Roseman informed that ISOC talks aims at open and resilient principles and an accessible framework for the world. She added is very impressed about the spirit of open and transparent multistakeholder process in the preparation of NETmundial. ISOC is taking the opportunity very seriously.

Civil society: Luis Pouzin

Mr. Pouzin informed that his community is still working and coming up with a number of principles to submit as contribution to NETmundial and framework aiming to make the internet more respectful to human rights. The online world must enjoy the same human rights as the offline one, there must not be discrimination in access and contents due to criteria such as opinion, religion, race, gender, geography, language, or economic resources. In addition, online world there

should be equitable, sometimes translated as network neutrality. No company, institution or state should have dominance in terms of traffic. It was also mentioned that Internet availability, deployment, and service conditions must benefit all segments of the human society, not just those enjoying richer economic development. A special effort must be engaged in order to provide the Less Developed Countries with an equitable share of resources to participate in activities related to worldwide internet governance.

H.E. Neelie Kroes

Added a point related to Mr. Tarek Kamel words. It should not be a shame for governments to be ambitious. If there is no ambition in this project, then there is loss of credibility since there is no way to explain the absence of reasons to take action. The reasons exist and people are expecting that this problem is tackled. The very sincere and serious preparation of the Brazilian presidency gives confidence that decisions and big steps forward can be taken, although there will never be an end of the story. Asked to be as practical as possible.

Mr. Tarek Kamel

Pointed out that there is no concern with those principles. His concern would be about an escalation on expectations in the community about ICANN and IANA globalization, surveillance, neutrality, spam, and so forth. It is a duty for the HLMC to be ambitious, to do the maximum, but also to take decisions and set the appropriate tone for the community.

H.E. Neelie Kroes

But also a timeline to globalize ICANN.

Mr. Tarek Kamel

Agree.

Private Sector: Christopher Steck

Mr. Steck expressed support to the conference in the way to be a great success in moving the debate forward. The internet has evolved over the last years so naturally there has been an evolution in the process. At the same time, there should be clear that it's not possible to solve all issues in the conference. The need for a roadmap is very welcomed and is looking forward to concrete steps and not solving all the problems.

Chairman Virgilio Almeida

Pointed thatthe multistakeholder fashion is taken very seriously besides the difficulties to put together all communities. However, the process is working and ongoing and expressed that the wish of the Brazilian President is related to practical results.

Contributions from remote participants (received by text):
Private Sector: Joseph Alhadeff

There have been significant discussions about the difficulty of getting to consensus, in this compressed time frame. While we all share the desire to work towards that objective we note that there are many sets of principles already in existence as highlighted by work posted to 1-Net as well as work that was undertaken by the ICANN experts report. If we set the objective as only some form of issuance of principles then an inability to achieve that objective would seem to be a failure.

We should perhaps have an objective as to progress towards such a confluence of themes across existing principles and positions. Should we be able to deliver more all the better. The Minister from Ghana is making this point as well, I believe. Finally we would underscore the need to assure stability, unity and operational continuity of the system.

Further to the comment of civil society as to organization, we are working on developing a common business position. We see our role more as Liasons than representatives per se and thus our ability to have time for consultation with the broader group is highly valued and essential. We would urge that processes be maintained to assure this ability for consultation to assure the ability to properly reflect the breadth of views within the community.

Private Sector: Jimson Olufuye

Good evening the Chair, your excellences, distinguished ladies and gentlemen. My name is Jimson Olufuye, Chair of AfICTA - Africa ICT Alliance, a private sector-led ICT initiative for Africa and the CEO of Kontemporary, an ICT SME based in Abuja, Nigeria. I'm pleased to be one of the 3 biz reps in this Committee. I've a brief comment and an expression of expectations of many from the business community, with special focus on the African ICT sector, which I am part of, for the NETMundial. Since the 2005 WSIS, when participation in the global IG discussions began its evolutionary transformation into truly MS mechanisms and processes, the private sector has continued to participate prominently and the diversity of such participation is evident by my inclusion, along with others from the private sector, in the membership of this Committee. So, African businesses and in particular businesses in developing and least developed economies see continuous growth and development through the platform provided by the Internet and as such are very much interested in the NETMundial meeting as one avenue where further examinations of how to support building CONFIDENCE, assuring STABILITY, strengthening the SECURITY and the RESILIENCY of one un-fragmented Internet.

As we prepare, there is need for: 1. Constructive and continuous engagement with all stakeholders in line with the focus of NETMundial. 2. Openness, broad and fair participation of all stakeholders representatives in the discussions and debates. 3. Awareness that there is a much broader range of critically important and related events, and that NETMundial is part of a larger ecosystem where the outputs of NETMundial can be considered further. 4. Accelerated processing of invitation letters for visas or possibly visa on arrival for accredited participants? As well as a focus on other mechanisms which enable fair and balanced participation, including language translation, transcription of sessions, and a balanced approach to inclusion of speakers and participants. It is my experience that many concerned and interested participants will want to listen actively, and we must accommodate that, if NETMundial is to be seen as fair and open. 5. Empowerment of effective participation of stakeholders from developing and least developed economies through fair and accountable funding support mechanisms. Where that may not be 100% possible, robust arrangement as indicated should be made to enable remote participation and webcast of proceedings of the event. Also, I must note that small businesses, and their representatives must be treated on an equal footing with all other funded participants, if we are to have the balance of all voices. 6. Finally, I want to note that while welcoming and fully planning engagement in the NETMundial event, I join with others from all stakeholders, in the IGF MAG, who noted the importance of NETMundial planning to participate fully in the upcoming IGF in Turkey, 2-5 September, this year.