E/CN.16/2012/CRP.2

**Commission on Science and Technology for Development**

**Fifteenth session**

Geneva, 21-25 May 2012

**Briefing on the open consultation on enhanced cooperation on public policy issues related to the Internet**

**18 May 2012**

**Summary report of the Chair**

**Briefing on the open consultation on enhanced cooperation on public policy issues related to the Internet, 18 May 2012**

**Summary report of the Chair**

In its resolution (A/RES/66/184) on *Information and communications technologies for development*, the General Assembly asked the Chair of the CSTD to convene a one-day open, inclusive and interactive meeting, involving all Member States and other stakeholders, particularly those from developing countries, including the private sector, civil society and international organisations, with a view to identifying a shared understanding about enhanced cooperation on public policy issues pertaining to the Internet, in accordance with paragraphs 34 and 35 of the Tunis Agenda.

The Chair of the CSTD convened this one-day meeting at the office of the International Labour Organisation in Geneva on 18 May 2012. It was attended by 54 governments and 77 other participants, who are listed in an Annex.

In opening the meeting, the Chair reminded delegates and participants that paragraphs 29-82 of the *Tunis Agenda for the Information Society*, which was agreed at the World Summit on the Information Society in 2005, established guidelines for future policy-oriented discussion of Internet governance, including the establishment of an Internet Governance Forum (IGF), and the implementation of ‘enhanced cooperation … to enable governments, on an equal footing, to carry out their roles and responsibilities, in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet, but not in the day-to-day technical and operational matters, that do not impact on international public policy issues.’

The meeting began with seven short presentations from experts representing diverse stakeholder communities concerned with Internet governance and enhanced cooperation. The presenters were:

* Mr Alexander Ntoko, speaking on behalf of the Secretary-General of the International Telecommunication Union, Dr Hamadoun Touré;
* Ms Anriette Esterhuysen, Executive Director of the Association for Progressive Communications;
* Mr Parminder Singh, Executive Director of IT for Change;
* Mr Nigel Hickson, Vice-President for Europe of the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers (ICANN);
* Mr Markus Kummer, Vice-President of Public Policy for the Internet Society (ISOC);
* Ms Marilia Maciel, from the Center for Technology and Society – Getulio Vargas Foundation, Brazil;
* Ms Marilyn Cade, Chief Executive Officer of mCADE LLC.

Contributions to the debate were made by 21 governments and by 12 participants from other stakeholder communities.

Governments and other participants emphasised the growing importance of the Internet in economic and social development, at both national and international levels. They recognised that the Internet is a distributed system, and that it requires participation of diverse stakeholder groups, including governments, the private sector, civil society, technical and academic communities, and intergovernmental organisations, in their respective roles. Delegates felt it to be important that decisions concerning Internet governance and enhanced cooperation should address both public and private interests, that they should foster the innovative development of Internet access, services and usage, and that they should contribute to the achievement of international development goals.

Governments and other participants recognised that the *Tunis Agenda on the Information Society* has established the framework within which enhanced cooperation on international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet should take place. They also acknowledged that the Internet and Internet governance have changed substantially since the adoption of the *Tunis Agenda*, and that the steps now required to achieve enhanced cooperation must take recent developments into account.

Governments and other participants acknowledged and welcomed the inclusion of diverse stakeholder groups in discussion and development concerning the Internet. Delegates emphasised that a multistakeholder approach was essential for Internet governance and enhanced cooperation on international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet. Some delegates emphasised the importance of defining the roles of different stakeholders, of establishing an appropriate balance between different interests in Internet governance, and of ensuring transparency and accountability.

Delegates noted that the *Tunis Agenda* identified two mechanisms required for the development of Internet governance – the Internet Governance Forum; and enhanced cooperation on international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet. Some governments and other participants felt that the *Tunis Agenda* established these as two distinct processes requiring different implementation mechanisms. Other governments and participants felt that the *Tunis Agenda* envisaged closer integration between them, and that the IGF itself could be one appropriate vehicle for enhanced cooperation.

There was praise for the achievements of the IGF, which was felt to have established a sound basis for multistakeholder dialogue about Internet governance and public policy issues. Several delegates noted that the IGF has stimulated the exchange of views and ideas about a wide range of Internet issues, including critical Internet resources. The work and report of the CSTD Working Group on Improvements to the IGF were recognised as a contribution towards further improvement of this important Forum. Some participants also emphasised the need to strengthen the IGF.

A number of governments felt that, while the IGF has become an established and valued mechanism in Internet governance, progress towards enhanced cooperation on international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet has been much more limited. Participants noted the lack of common understanding on enhanced cooperation on international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet. There was a common understanding among delegates and participants that governments have an important role in Internet governance, within the multistakeholder framework established by the *Tunis Agenda*.

Some delegates called for the establishment of an intergovernmental mechanism for enhanced cooperation within the United Nations structure, which would enable governments, on an equal footing, to carry out their roles and responsibilities in international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet. They emphasised the need to initiate, and reinforce, a transparent, democratic, and multilateral process as provided for in the *Tunis Agenda*. A number of different ways in which such a mechanism could be established were suggested.

A number of other governments and participants suggested, however, that enhanced cooperation, along the lines envisaged in the *Tunis Agenda*, is already taking place, although there are certain gaps or needs for improvement that should be addressed. This cooperation was apparent in existing Internet governance mechanisms, including the Internet Governance Forum, the Governmental Advisory Committee and other mechanisms of the Internet Corporation for Assigned Names and Numbers, a variety of other intergovernmental, international and Internet organisations, as well as more informal mechanisms and arrangements. These governments and other participants suggested that enhanced cooperation could be developed starting from these existing mechanisms.

A number of suggestions were made concerning the next stage of work to facilitate enhanced cooperation as envisaged in the *Tunis Agenda*.

Some delegates recommended that existing Internet governance entities should be invited again to submit reports concerning their work to enhance cooperation, along the lines of reports on this subject which were requested by the Secretary-General in 2006.

Several delegates suggested that it would be valuable to collect examples of cooperation on international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet which are currently taking place, in both United Nations and other contexts. These could then be mapped and reviewed in order to identify gaps in existing cooperation, to establish the effectiveness of these examples of cooperation in enabling governments to fulfil their responsibilities, and to suggest ways in which cooperation could be further enhanced. It was suggested that this would provide a systematic evidence base for decision-making by governments and international organisations including the CSTD.

One government emphasised that the principal challenge facing the CSTD was to identify the next step required for achieving progress towards enhanced cooperation, building on those areas of common understanding which had been identified during the meeting.

A number of delegates and other participants suggested the establishment of a multistakeholder working group which could give further consideration to the best ways of achieving enhanced cooperation. They noted that gaps remain in addressing international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet, emphasising the need to address issues such as the digital divide, accessibility, affordability, inclusiveness, dominance and control of the Internet, cyber-security and privacy. A number of ways in which such a working group could be established were suggested. Some delegates compared this approach with the appointment of the Working Group on Internet Governance by the Secretary-General between the first and second phases of the World Summit on the Information Society.

Delegates suggested a number of topics which might be considered by such a working group, including the development of overarching principles for enhanced cooperation, the definition of roles and responsibilities of different stakeholder communities, the mapping of existing Internet governance institutions, and the modalities of multilateral and multistakeholder approaches. If such a working group were established, delegates noted, consideration would need to be given by the CSTD to its selection, funding and working methods.

In summarising the discussion, the Chair observed that, while significant cooperation concerning international public policy issues pertaining to the Internet is taking place, there remain gaps in cooperation which need to be addressed. He noted the emphasis which participants placed on enabling stakeholders, including governments, to fulfil the roles recognised for them in the *Tunis Agenda*, within an overall framework of multistakeholder cooperation supported by transparency and accountability. A number of suggestions had been made during the meeting, including the suggestion that there should be an intergovernmental mechanism to fulfil the mandate of governments, the suggestion that future arrangements for enhanced cooperation could be built upon existing mechanisms and experience of cooperation amongst governments and other stakeholders, and the suggestion for a multistakeholder Working Group on Enhanced Cooperation. These suggestions are to be considered further by the CSTD during its 15th meeting.

**ANNEX** **1 – Provisional list of participants**

**States Members of the Commission**

**Austria**

Ms. Vera Fuchs, First Secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Brazil**

Mr. Benedicto Fonseca Filho, Ambassador, Ministry of External Relations

Mr. Thiago Couto Carveiro, Permanent Mission to the WTO, Geneva

**China**

Mr. Chunlu Zhao, Deputy Director, Ministry of Industry & Information Technology, Beijing

Mr. Wang Xiaoying, First Secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Democratic Republic of Congo**

Mr. Sendwe Mputi Péguy, Député National, Assemblee National

Ms. Angelique Milemba Bukasa, Députée National, Assemblee Nationale

Mr. François Nzekuye Kaburabuza, Député National, Parlement National

Mr. Pancrace Boongo Nakoy, Député National, Assemblee National

**Dominican Republic**

Ms. Bello de Kemper Magaly, Ministro Consejera, Permanent Mission to the WTO, Geneva

**El Salvador**

Mr. Felix Ulloa, Minister Counsellor, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Finland**

Mr. Juuso Moisander, Commercial Secretary, MFA

**France**Ms. Camille Angue, French Representative, French Ministry of Foreign & European Affairs
Ms. Natacha Tolstoi, Counsellor, French Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Ghana**

Mr. Anthony Kwasi Nyame Baafi, Minister, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Hungary**

Mr. Andras Dekany, Ambassador, Permanent Mission, Geneva

Mr. Peter Major, Special Adviser, Permanent Mission, Geneva

Ms. Onodi Krisztina, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Mr. Mark Horvath, Deputy, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**India**

Mr. Dilip Sinha, Ambassador, Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission, Geneva

Mr. Kheya Bhattacharya, Deputy Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission, Geneva

Mr. Govind, Senior Director, Ministry of Communications

Mr. Rabindra Nath Jha, Director General, Dept. of Telecommunication, Government of India

Mr. Anil Kumar Sharma, Minister, Permanent Mission, Geneva

Ms. Alpana Dubey, First Secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Iran**

Mr. Ali Asghar Ansari, Deputy of ITO, ICT Ministry of Iran, Information Technology Organization (ITO)

Mr. Seyyed Arash Vakilian, Ministry of Culture, Information Technology and Digital Media Development Center

Mr. Aboutalebi Mahammad Masoud, Chief Adviser to IRIB President, IRIB

Mr. Behnam Valizadeh, Vice-Director of Network Management, Ministry of ICT

Mr. Yousef Nouri, Ministry of Education

**Israel**

Ms. Dana Soffer Scetbun, Adviser, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Jordan**

Mr. Wesam Ramadeen, Board Member, Telecommunications Regulatory Commission

Mr. Raed Zahrani, head of Strategic Planning Dept, Ministry of Information and Communication Technologies

**Lesotho**

Mr. Lefa Thamae, Ministry of Communication, Science and Technology

Mr. Moshe Kao, Minister Counsellor, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Oman**

Ms. Zahra Al-Rawahi, Director of ICT Research, The Research Council

Mr. Said Al-Mandhari, IT Adviser, The Research Council

**Peru**

Mr. Miguel Palomino de la Gala, Ambassador, Director for Science and Technology, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Mr. Carlos Rossi, Counselor, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Philippines**

Mr. Evan P. Garcia, Ambassador, Permanent Representative, Permanent Mission; Geneva

Mr. Fortunato dela Pena, Undersecretary for Science and Technology

Ms. Elizabeth T. Te, First Secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Portugal**

Mr. Luis Magalhaes, Professor, Technical University of Lisbon

Ms. Ana Cristina Amoroso Neves, Ministry of Education and Science

Ms. Magdalena Reis, Delegate, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Russian Federation**

Mr. Alexey Khoryushin, Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications

Mr. Igor Nickonov, Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications

Mr. Ivan Chalin, Ministry of Telecom and Mass Communications

Mr. Alexander Petron, Counsellor, Permanent Mission; Geneva

**Saudi Arabia**

Mr. Abdullah Aldarrab, Communication and Information Technology Commission,

Mr. Mohamed Algasem, Ministry of Communications and IT

Mr. Fareed Y. Khashoggi, Deputy Minister, Ministry of Communications and IT

Mr. Al Otaibi Talal, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Sri Lanka**

Mr. Vijaya Kumar, Industrial Technology Institute

**South Africa**

Ms. Tshihumbudzo Ravhandalala, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Switzerland**

Mr. Pierre Smolik, Office federal de la communication

Mr. Dirk Oliver Von Der Emden, Legal Adviser, OFCOM

**Tunisia**

Mr. Ridha Guellouz, Director General, Ministry of ICT

**USA**

Ms. Frances Chisholm, Economic Counselor, Permanent Mission, Geneva

Mr. Craig Reilly, First secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

Ms. Bryana Tucci, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Observers**

**Albania**

Ms. Dorima Xhixho, Second Secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Algeria**

Mr. Mohamed Bait, Secretary General, Ministry of Post and ITC

Mr. Mahiddine Ouhadj, Director of Studies, Ministry of Post and ITC

Mr. Elhadj Lamine, Deputy Director, MOFA

Mr. Mohamed Bessam, DG, Ministry of Post and ITC

Ms. Brahimi Zahia, Director, Ministry of Post and ITC

**Angola**

Mr. Gaspar Da Silva, Counsellor, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Argentina**

Ms. Olga Cavalli, Advisor, Ministry of Foreign Affairs

Mr. Alexis Am, First Secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Azerbaijan**

Mr. Ayaz A. Bayramov, Head, Dept. International Relations, Ministry of Communications and IT

Mr. Fuad Mushtagov, Advisor, MCIT

**Bahrain**

Mr. Maher Alkam, Assistant Director, Egovernement Authority

Mr. Ali Darwis, Head, Public Relations, Egovernement Authority

**Bangladesh**

Mr. Md Nazrul Islam, Minister, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Belgium**

Mr. Pierre Yves Charles, Attaché, Ministry of Economic Affairs

Mr. Marc Clairbois, Delegué Wallonic-Brussels, Permanent Mission

**Brunei Darussalam**

Mr. Jailani Buntar, Assistant Chief Executive, Authority for Info-Communications, Technology Industry

Mr. Eng Hong Poh, Director of Information Technology, Ministry of Communications

**Canada**

Ms. Heather Dryden,Senior Advisor, Department of Industry, Chair, Governmental Advisory Committee

**Cyprus**

Ms. Spathi Myrianthi, Second Secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Denmark**

Ms. Line Skytte Pedersen, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Ecuador**

Mr. Danilo R. Corral de Witt, Engineer, Escuela Politecnica del Ejercito

**Egypt**

Mr. Hisham Badr, Ambassador, Geneva

Mr. Yasser Hassan, Minister Plenipotentiary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

Ms. Nermine El Saadany, Director, International relations, Ministry of Communications

Mr. Hisham Aboulyazed, Senior Manager, NTRA

Ms. Nashwa Gad, Department Manager, Ministry of Communications

**German**

Ms. Gabriela Bennemann, Permanent Mission, Geneva

Ms. Annika Schmidtke, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Haiti**

Mr. Jean-David Rodney, Ingenieur/Consultant, Conseil National des Telecommunications

**Italy**

Ms. Isabel Riboldi, Permanent Mission, Geneva

Ms. Claudia Savarese, Intern, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Japan**

Mr. Atsushi Umino, Director for International Policy Coordination, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications

Ms. Naoko Seta, Assistant Manager, Ministry of Internal Affairs and Communications

Mr. Hirokazu Igarashi, First Secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Kuwait**

Mr. Qusai Alshatti, Deputy Director for IT, Central Agency for Information Technology

**Libya**

Mr. Nabil Hinayona, Second Secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Mexico**

Ms. Victoria Romero, First Secretary, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Monaco**

Ms. Martine Garcia, Troisième secrétaire, Permanent Mission, Geneva

**Morocco**

Ms. Fakhri Rachida, Head of egov Department, Ministry of Trade, Industry and New Technologies,

**Netherlands**

Mr. W.M. Rullens, Head, International Organisations, Ministry of Economic Affairs, Agriculture and Innovation

**Nepal**

Mr. Girinda Raj Adhikari, Member, Nepal Telecommunication Authority

**Qatar**

Mr. Hashem Mustafawi Al Hashemi, State of Qatar Representative at ITU

**Sudan**

Mr. Mohamed Awad Mohamed Osman, Director of State Minister of CIT

**Togo**

Mr. Narteh Messan Komlan, Second Secretary, Permanent Mission

**United Arab Emirates**

Mr. Ahmd Mohamed, GM

**United Kingdom**

Mr. Mark Carvell, Head, Global Internet Governance Policy, UK Government Department for Culture, Media and Sport

**United Nations, Specialized agencies and related organizations**

**ECA**

Mr. Makane Faye

**ESCWA**

Mr. Ayman El-Sherbiny, Chief, ICT Policies Section, Lebanon

**ITU**

Mr. Preetam Maloor, Strategy Analyst

Mr. Diaby Moussa

Mr. Ravindra K. Chopra, ICT Expert

Mr. Michael Kioy

Ms. Carment Lilian Marin Ramirez

Mr. Sebastian de Bryune

Mr. Juan Sabogal

Ms. Kira Burke

Ms. Anita Sandana

Mr. Suliman Suliman

Mr. Ewandro Magalhaes

Mr. Anders Norsker

Mr. Svein Tenningas

Mr. Edmund Tam

Mr. Guy Girardet

Ms. Marta Garcia Aliaga

Ms. Gitanjali Sah

**UNDP**

Mr. Elnur Khalilov, Programme Adviser

**United Nations University**

Mr. Sulayman K. Sowe, Research Fellow

**UNESCO**

Mr. Janis Karklins

Ms. Mika Yamanaka

Mr. Cédric Wachholz

**WMO**

Mr. P. SHI, Director WMO Information System

**Intergovernmental, Non-governmental organizations, civil society and business entities**

**Acceque**

Mr. Christopher Jones

**Africa Link Organization**

Mr. Atsen Ahua

**African ICT Consumers Network**

Mr. A.Romain Houehou, Coordinator

**APNIC**

Mr. Pablo Hinojosa, Public Affairs Director

**BPW International**

Ms. Elisabeth Clement-Arnold

**Caption First**

Ms. Kathy Cortopassi

**CAPSDH**

Ms. Ana Leurinda

**CEDIDE**

Mr. Biro Diawara

**CMDC ISEO**

Ms. Roswitha Grass, Committee member

**Commonwealth Telecommunication Organization**

Mr. Tim Unwin, CEO

Mr. L. De Alvis, Corporate Secretary

**Collab CPR**

Mr. David Allen

**COMNET Foundation**

Ms. Lara Pace

**Comoros Telecom**

Mr. Omar Abdou

**CSDPT – CESIR**

Mr. Jean-Luis Fullsack

**Diplo Foundation**

Mr. Jovan Kurbalija, Director

Mr. Vladimir Radunevic

**European Commission**

Mr. Andrea Glorioso, Policy Officer

**EUROLINC**

Mr. Michel Peissik, Membre du conseil d’administration

**FANCV**

Ms. Graciela R. Yanovsky

**Galway Strategy Group**

Mr. Jim Prendergast

**Ghana Regional Maritime University**

Mr. Joseph K. Kpodo

**Health Industry**

Mr. Beat von Weissenfluh

**HEP**

Ms. Madeleine Scher, Executive President

Mr. Pierre Scherls

**ICANN**

Mr. Baher Esmat, Manager, Regional Relations Organization

**ICC**

Ms. Ayesha Hassan, Executive in charge of ICT policy

**Institute for Infosocioenomics**

Mr. Izumi Aizu, Senior Research Fellow

**ISU**

Mr. Ali Almashat, Professor

**IFIP**

Mr. Raymond Morel, Professor

**IFIP International Professional Practice Partnership**

Ms. Brenda Aynsley, Chairman

**IGF Public Union**

Mr. Barat Talibou, Director

**IGF 2012**

Mr. Nariman Hajiyev, Project Manager

**International Diplomatic Academy**Mr. Bertrand De La Chapelle, Program Director

**ISOC**

Ms. Constance Bommelaer

**Konsulttitoimisto Puhettako Oy**

Mr. Kristo Helasvuo

**LAE**

Mr. Maurizio Incerpi

**Manchester Metropolitan University**

Ms. Nabeera Rahman

**Massai Experience**

Ms. Ait Kaci, President

**MSH**

Mr. Benjamin Akinmoyeje

**MSP**

Ms. Jitka Diepoldova

**NOMINET**

Mr. Martin Boyle, Senior Policy Advisor

**NTC**

Mr. Sami Salih

**NXT**
Mr. Kieren Mccarthy

**ONAT**

Mr. Vadim Kaptur

**Organisation Internationale de la Francophonie**Mr. Pierre Ouedraogo, Director

**Promotic**

Mr. Gregory Domond, Chairman

**Raising the Floor**

Mr. Gregg Vanderheiden

**School of Diplomacy and International relations**

Mr. Claudio Montesano, Project manager

**SCIS**

Mr. Erich Kofmel, Mananging Director

**Stockholm University**

Ms. Paula Uimonen, Director, Spider

**Sultan Qaboos University**

Mr. Saleh Said Hamed Al-Shidhani, Assistant Professor

**TWN**

Mr. Rapaoori Madavaw Gopakomar, Legal Advisor

**Women in Technology**

Ms. Martha Omoekpan Alade, Chairperson

**UAEMEX**

Mr. Daniel José Gutiérrez López

**Univ Academia**

Ms. Dzita Stephanie Kpodch

**University of Antwerp**

Ms. Joana Portia Antwi-Nanso

**University of Geneva**

Mr. Kaveh Bazargan

**University of Wisconsin**

Ms. Paige Miller

**University of Zurich**

Mr. William Drake

**Uva**

Ms. Alina Pascarel

**Verisign Inc**

Ms. Irena Borissova

**Verisign Colombia SAS**

Mr. Ricardo Pedraza-Barrios, Director, Global Public Policy

**WITSA**

Mr. Jimson Olufuye, Vice-Chairman

**WFEO**

Mr. Mohamed Tijani Ben Jemaa, Vice Chair, Committee on Info & Communication

**Other participants**

Ms. Baazia Riad, Adviser

Ms. Avri Doria
Ms. Andrea Saks, Consultant

Ms. Mila Kot

Ms. Ify Alonu

Ms. Ginger Paque

**Resource persons**

Mr. Hamadoun Touré**,** Secretary-General, International Telecommunication Union (ITU)

Ms. Anriette Esterhuysen, Executive Director, Association for Progressive Communications

Mr. Parminder Singh, Executive Director, IT for Change

Mr. Nigel Hickson, Vice President for Europe, ICANN

Mr. Markus Kummer, Vice President Public Policy, Internet Society

Ms. Marilia Maciel, Project Leader and Researcher, Center for Technology and Society Fundação Getulio Vargas

Ms. Marilyn Cade, CEO, mCADE LLC