# becoming artifacts
## Medieval seals, Passports and the Future of Digital Identity

## Mawaki Chango

*Diplôme d'Études Approfondies* (1996) in Political Science at Panthéon-Sorbonne University, Paris I
*Diplôme d'Études Approfondies* (1995), *Maîtrise* (1993) and *Licence* (1992) in Philosophy at Charles de Gaulle University, Lille III

## Dissertation (Preview)
Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in Information Science and Technology from the Graduate School of Syracuse University

## April 2012
SYRACUSE UNIVERSITY: SYRACUSE, NEW YORK

Defense Chair: Dr. Gavan Duffy, Maxwell School of Citizenship and Public Affairs

Advisor: Dr. Lee McKnight, School of Information Studies

Committee:

Dr. Shiu-Kai Chin, L.C. Smith College of Engineering and Computer Science

Dr. Kevin Crowston, School of Information Studies

Dr. Patricia Longstaff, S.I. Newhouse School of Public Communications

Dr. Milton Mueller, School of Information Studies

Dr. Murali Venkatesh, School of Information Studies

## Abstract

What does a digital identity token have to do with medieval seals? Is the history of passports of any use for enabling the discovery of Internet users' identity when crossing virtual domain boundaries during their digital browsing and transactions? The agility of the Internet architecture and its simplicity of use have been the engines of its growth and success with the users worldwide. As it turns out, there lies also its crux. In effect, Internet industry participants have argued that the critical problem business is faced with on the Internet is the absence of an identity layer from the core protocols of its logical infrastructure. As a result, the cyberspace parallels a global "territory" without any identification mechanism that is reliable, consistent and interoperable across domains. This dissertation is an investigation of the steps being taken by Internet's stakeholders in order to resolve its identity problems, through the lenses of historical instances where similar challenges were tackled by social actors.

Social science research addressing the Internet identity issues is barely nascent. Research on identification systems in general is either characterized by a paucity of historical perspective, or scantily references digital technology and online identification processes. This research is designed to bridge that gap. The general question at its core is: *How do social actors and processes enable the emergence and effective use of authoritative identity credentials for the public?* This work is guided by that line of inquiry through three broad historical case studies: first, the medieval experience with seals used as identity tokens in the signing of deeds that resulted in transfers of rights, particularly estate rights; second, comes the modern state with its claim to the right to know all individuals on its territory through credentials such as the passport

or the national identity card; and finally, viewed from the United States, the case of ongoing efforts to build a stable and robust digital identity infrastructure.

In the process, we understand the relationship of seals to the doctrines of the Trinity and the Eucharist developed by schoolmen within the medieval Church, and we understand how crucial it was for the modern state to coin the legal category of nationality – which emerged as late as in the 19th century – for its identification project. Following an inductive and process-tracing approach to historical case study, this investigation incrementally builds an analytical framework gathering a number of factors that demonstrate an explanatory quality or potential as well as the main analytical insights gained during this inquiry. An ordering of those factors is proposed as a way to capture the causal mechanisms at work across these large sequences and structures. In the analysis of the third case, the making of digital identity is assessed against that backdrop. While the findings of this case appear to consolidate the framework already outlined, new trajectories of implementation-adoption also emerge. Drawing on the rich history of large-scale identification systems, this work generates a number of insights that qualify our expectations about identity technology design and policymaking. It also proposes possible scenarios and pathways to the realization of authoritative digital identity, some plausible and some other less so, which stakeholders may consider. But this is just the beginning of yet another story of identity.

To my late mother


Theodora K. E. T.
  (1943 – 2011)



In memoriam


*our feast may have been deferred*
*our chant turned into a clamor of dust*
*still reverberate across all verbs of my being*
*the humming of my inaugural cell and*
*the streaming of our primitive waters*
*until times reconfigure our cypher*


*here too we shall abide*

M. C.

# Table of Contents

## LIST OF EXHIBITS

**Figures:**

**Tables:**

## Acknowledgements

I would like first to thank people at the Internet Identity Workshop and in the Digital Identity community in general for being the source of the motivation for this research. More particularly, I would like to recognize individuals who have helped form my understanding of what digital identity technology entails or who have informed this research effort in one way or the other. They include Eve Maler, Drummond Reed, Stefan Brands, Dick Hardt, Scott David, Phil Windley, Paul Trevithick, Johannes Ernst, Trent Adams, Kim Cameron, Marc Davis, Tony Rutkowski, Mary Ruddy, and Glenn Benson.

I also want to thank my committee members for their time, advice and fellowship during this long and winding process, which is full of doubts but also filled with intellectual epiphanies. I am thankful for having dear friends such as Jeff and Peg Owens as well as Pat and Ben Addom around at troubling times. Finally, I want to express my heartfelt gratitude to Ellen Hobbs, Gina Lee-Glauser and Mark Glauser for their invaluable support at the most critical of those moments throughout that journey.

To all of you, many thanks!

## Overture

*Ithaca, at last! ...*

*After long years of sailing, Odysseus (also known as Ulysses) can now see his native shore emerge from the horizon. He returns home after a score of years, the first decade fighting the Trojan War followed by another of tribulations at high seas on his way back to Ithaca. Now he has to confront Penelope's wooers and suitors rivaling to replace him as her husband. In the face of their constant pressure, she has so far devised efforts and tricks to put off marriage. And now after such a long leave of absence and all the tribulations, there he is, Odysseus! Or is he? Under the guise of a beggar draped in a halo of mist, by the favor of the goddess Athena, how to tell who that visitor is?*

*Repeatedly in his encounters over the course of his epic voyage, was that man of many ways asked to reveal his identity, to no avail. Now that at long last he sets foot again in homeland, his identity once without question across the realm now is yet to be ascertained ... by Penelope of all people! In order to regain his place by her side, not only did he have to decimate the ranks of the young and arrogant princes vying for her hand, but he now have to face her unwavering incredulity.*

*When the hero of countless feats reached for the prize of the bride, he is yet to face the ultimate test. Penelope figures an impromptu and less spectacular probe for the man she still doubts to be Odysseus. Only the two spouses knew that one leg of their bridal bed was built – by Odysseus himself – out of the trunk of an actual tree. So when Penelope ostensibly pretends to order the bed displaced, the returning hero cannot help but be surprised by such request given the impossibility of the task, unless the leg of the bed was*

*cut off from the tree. For Penelope, there eventually lies the unbreakable proof of the*

*identity of the presumed stranger: she can finally recognize and welcome back her long*

*awaited mate.*

*Odysseus, at long last!* [1]

There is no better place (*topos*) for our departure in this endeavor than the return of Odysseus. Told very long ago, this story provides us with a narrative that the so-called Western world has come to regard as a matrix for many of its self-defining narratives – a tale of origins as well as a tale of identity. Only once during his epic journey did Odysseus make an attempt to tell who he was: to the Cyclops who asked 'who are you?' he cryptically dropped: My name is Nobody[2]. A person who is Nobody – for somebody. That's where the identity quest begins. Hopefully, it will lead to that person being something more than Nobody, being Someone – for somebody.

---

[1] From *Odyssey* by Homer, I first heard the story of Penelope and the bed test by the late Hellenist Jean-Pierre Vernant when he came to give a talk at my Philosophy department at the University of Lille in the early 1990s. About Odysseus's identity, see Vernant and Ker (1999) and Dimock (1956). Another variation on the theme of identity and homecoming after a long period of absence is Martin Guerre's story: see Davis (1993).

[2] While 'nobody' is unambiguously a negative in English, its equivalent in many Latin-born languages is more neutral (and can be used negatively as well as positively). *Person* in French for example translates to English both as 'person' and as 'nobody' (i.e. 'not any one person'), depending on the syntactic context. The Greek word translated in Latin by *persona* originally means mask as worn by actors representing their character in the Greek tragedy. An important conceptual development occurred in the post-millennium Middle Ages where the term is made to mean a facet of an individual, as with the Trinity of the three persons in a unique God by the teachings of the Roman Catholic Church.

# References

**Bibliography**

Amenta, Edwin. 2008. Making the Most of a Historical Case Study: Configuration, Sequence, Casing, and the US Old-age Pension Movement. In *The Sage Handbook of Case-Based Methods*, ed. David Byrne and Charles C. Ragin. Thousand Oaks, Cal.: Sage, pp. 351-366.

Bedos-Rezak, B. 1995. "Seals and Sigillography." In *Medieval France: An Encyclopedia,* ed. by Kibler, W. W. and G. A. Zinn. New York: Garland Publishers.

Bedos-Rezak, B. 2000. Medieval Identity: A Sign and a Concept. *The American Historical Review*. Vol. 105, No. 5 (December 2000)

Benson, Glenn, Shiu-Kai Chin, Sean B. Croston, Karthick Jayaraman, and Susan Older. 2011. Interoperable Credentials Management for Wholesale Banking. Syracuse University and JPMorgan Chase & Co.

Blumenthal, Uta-Renate. 2004. Church Organization and Functions. In *Medieval Italy: An Encyclopedia*, vol. 1, ed. Kleinhenz. New York and London: Routledge.

Bolter, J. D. 1991. *Writing Space: The Computer, Hypertext, and the History of Writing*. Hillsdale, N.J.: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates Publishers

Bouchard, C. B. 1995. Benefice (Nonecclesiastical). In *Medieval France: An Encyclopedia,* ed. by Kibler, W. W. and G. A. Zinn. New York: Garland Publishers.

Burawoy, M. 1998. The Extended Case Method. *Sociological Theory*, 16:1 (March 1998), pp. 4-33.

Burns, J. H. 1988. *The Cambridge History of Medieval Political Thought, c. 350 – c. 1450*. New York: Cambridge University Press.

Calhoun, C., ed. 1994. *Social Theory and the Politics of Identity*. Cambridge, MA: Blackwell

Canning, J. P. 1988. "Law, sovereignty and corporation theory, 1300–1450." In *The Cambridge History of Medieval Political Thought, c. 350 – c. 1450*, ed. Burns, J. H. New York: Cambridge University Press (pp. 454-476)

Caplan, J. and J. Torpey, eds. 2001. *Documenting Individual Identity: The Development of State Practices in the Modern World*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press

Castells, Manuel. 2010 [1997]. *The Power of Identity (The Information Age: Economy, Society and Culture. Volume II)*. Malden, MA: Wiley-Blackwell. Second edition with new Preface.

Clanchy, M. T. 1993. *From Memory to Written Record: England 1066-1307*. Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell Publishers

Clarke, Roger. 1994. Human Identification in Information Systems: Management Challenges and Public Policy Issues. *Information Technology & People*, 7(4). 6-37. Available at (June 13, 2010) http://www.rogerclarke.com/DV/HumanID.html

Cohen, S. Marc. 2009. Aristotle's Metaphysics. *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy* (Spring 2009 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2009/entries/aristotle-metaphysics/>.

Collon, Dominique. 2006. *First Impressions: Cylinder Seals in the Ancient Near East*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press; London: British Museum Press

Computer Science and Telecommunications Board (National Research Council). 2003. *Who Goes There? Authentication through the Lens of Privacy.* Committee on Authentication Technologies and Their Privacy Implications (ed. Kent, S. T. and L. I. Millet). Washington, D.C.: The National Academies Press.

Cross, F. L., and E. A. Livingstone, eds. 2005. *The Oxford Dictionary of the Christian Church* (Third Edition Revised). New York: Oxford University Press.

Croxton, D. and A. Tischer. 2001. *The Peace of Westphalia: A Historical Dictionary.* Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood.

Davis, Natalie Zemon. 1983. *The Return of Martin Guerre*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press.

Descartes, René. 1996 [1641]. *Descartes' Meditations* (a.k.a *Meditations on First Philosophy*). Available at http://www.wright.edu/cola/descartes/

Dimock, Jr. G. E. 1956. "The Name of Odysseus." *The Hudson Review*, Vol. 9, No. 1 (Spring 1956), pp. 52-70

Dudley, M. L. 1991. *The Word and the Sword: How Techniques of Information and Violence Have Shaped our World*. Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell.

Duranti, L. 1989. Diplomatics: New Uses for an Old Science. *Archivaria* 28 (Summer 1989), pp. 7-27.

Duranti, L. 1994. The Concept of Appraisal and Archival Theory. *American Archivist*, Vol. 57 (Spring 1994), pp. 328-344.

Duranti, L., T. Eastwood, and H. MacNeil. 2002. *Preservation of the integrity of electronic records*. Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Ekelund, R. B., Jr., R. F. Hébert, R. D. Tollison, G. M. Anderson, and A. B. Davidson. 1996. *Sacred Trust: The Medical Church as an Economic Firm*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Ekelund, R. B., Jr., R. F. Hébert, R. D. Tollison. 2011. The Political Economy of the Medieval Church. In *The Oxford Handbook of the Economics of Religion*, ed. by Rachel M. McCleary. New York: Oxford University Press (pp. 305-322)

Foucault, M. 1975. *Surveiller et Punir*. Paris: Gallimard. (Transl. Alan Sheridan: *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison.* New York: Vintage, 1977)

Foucault, M. 1988a. "Technologies of the Self." In *Technologies of the Self: A Seminar with Michel Foucault*, ed. L. H. Martin, H. Gutman, and P. H. Hutton. Amherst: The University of Massachusetts Press, pp. 16-49.

Foucault, M. 1988b. "The Political Technology of Individuals." In *Technologies of the Self: A Seminar with Michel Foucault*, ed. L. H. Martin, H. Gutman, and P. H. Hutton. Amherst: The University of Massachusetts Press, pp. 145-162.

Foucault, M. 1994. *The Order of Things: An archeology of the human sciences*. New York : Vintage Books.

Fraenkel, B. 1992. *La Signature: Genèse d'un Signe*. Paris: Gallimard.

Franklin, J., V. Paxson, A. Perrig, and S. Savage. 2007. An Inquiry into the Nature and Causes of the Wealth of Internet Miscreants. Retrieved on June 8, 2010 at http://citeseerx.ist.psu.edu/viewdoc/download?doi=10.1.1.119.9696&rep=rep1&type=pdf

Galloway, A. R. 2004. *Protocol: How Control Exists after Decentralization*. Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Garcelon, Marc. 2001. Colonizing the Subject: The Genealogy and Legacy of the Soviet Internal Passport. In *Documenting Individual Identity: The Development of State Practices in the Modern World*, ed. J. Caplan and J. Torpey. New Jersey: Princeton University Press

George, A. L. and A. Bennett. 2005. *Case Studies and Theory Development in the Social Sciences.* Cambridge, MA: MIT Press.

Golden-Biddle, K. and K. Locke. 1993. Appealing Work: And Investigation of How Ethnographic Texts Convince. *Organization Science*, Vol. 4, No. 4 (Nov. 1993), pp. 595-616

Gordon, G. R., S. Barber and F. H. Cate. 2009. "An Applied Research Agenda for Confronting Global Identity Management Challenges: Report for the CAIMR Identity Management Research Agenda Workshop, May 2009." Center for Applied Identity Management

Research, CAIMR. Available (Jan 19, 2010) at http://caimr.indiana.edu/documents/20090507_caimr_researchagenda.pdf

Grant, M. 1946. *From Imperium to Auctoritas*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Hall, John. 1999. *Cultures of Inquiry: From epistemology to discourse in sociohistorical research.* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press

Harper, Jim. 2006. *Identity Crisis: How Identification Is Overused and Misunderstood*. Cato Institute. Washington, D. C.

Hay, Colin. 2006. Political Ontology. In *The Oxford Handbook of Contextual Political Analysis*, ed. R. E. Goodin and C. Tilly. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 78-96.

Kant, I. 1997 [1781; 1787]. *Critique of Pure Reason* (trans. P. Guyer and A. Wood). Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press.

Kantorowicz, E. H. 1951. Pro Patria Mori in Medieval Political Thought. *The American Historical Review*, vol. 56, no. 3 (Apr. 1951), pp. 472-492. American Historical Association.

Kantorowicz, E. H. 1955. Mysteries of State: An Absolutist Concept and Its Late Medieval Origins. *The Harvard Theological Review*, vol. 48, no. 1 (Jan. 1955), pp. 65-91. Cambridge, Mass.: Cambridge University Press.

Kerr, Ian, Valerie Steeves, and Carole Lucock, eds. 2009. *Lessons from the Identity Trail: Anonymity, Privacy and Identity in a Networked Society*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Lessig, Lawrence. 2006. *Code* (version 2.0). New York: Basic Books.

Lettvin, J. Y., H. R. Maturana, W. S. McCulloch, and W. H. Pitts. 1957. "What the Frog's Eye Tells the Frog's Brain." *Proceedings of the Institute for Radio Engineers* 47, no. 11, 1940-51.

Lloyd, Martin. 2003. *The Passport: The history of man's most travelled document*. Gloucestershire: Sutton Publishing

Locke, John. 1995 [1690]. *An Essay Concerning Human Understanding*. ILT Digital Classics, Columbia University. Available at http://www.ilt.columbia.edu/publications/locke_understanding.html

MacNeil, H. 2000. *Trusting Records: Legal, Historical, and Diplomatic Perspectives*. Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Kluwer Academic Publishers.

Martin, H. L., H. Gutman, and P. H. Hutton, eds. 1988. *Technologies of the Self: A Seminar with Michel Foucault*. Amherst: The University of Massachusetts Press.

McCallum, R. J. 1976. *Abelard's Christian Theology*. New York: Richwood Publishing.

Miller, Jr., Fred D. 1973. Did Aristotle Have the Concept of Identity? *The Philosophical Review*, 82(4), pp. 483-490.

Morrison, Karl F. 2004. Investiture Controversy. In *Medieval Italy: An Encyclopedia*, vol. 1, ed. Kleinhenz. New York and London: Routledge.

Mueller, M. and M. Chango. 2008. "Disrupting Global Governance: The Internet Whois Service, ICANN, and Privacy." Journal of Information Technology and Politics. Vol. 5, No. 3 (fall 2008)

Muller, A. R. 1985. *Dictionary of the Latin and Greek Theological Terms. Drawn Principally from Protestant Scholastic Theology.* Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Book House

Noonan, H. W. 1989. *Personal Identity*. New York: Routledge (Second edition, 2003.)

Novak, Michael. 1963. A Key to Aristotle's Substance. *Philosophy and Phenomenological Research*, 24(1), pp. 1-19

Parfit, D. 1984. *Reasons and Persons*. New York: Clarendon/Oxford University Press. Reprinted with further corrections, 1987.

Pereboom, Derk. 2009. "Kant's Transcendental Arguments." *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Winter 2009 Edition)*, Edward N. Zalta, ed. URL = <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2009/entries/kant-transcendental/>.

Perry, J., ed. 1975. *Personal Identity*. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press (Second edition, 2008.)

Post, Gaines. 1964. *Studies in Medieval Legal Thought: Public Law and the State, 1100-1322*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press.

Powell, James. 2004. Holy Roman Empire. In *Medieval Italy: An Encyclopedia*, vol. 1, ed. Kleinhenz. New York and London: Routledge.

Rannenberg, Kai, Denis Royer, André Deuker, eds. 2009. *The Future of Identity in the Information Society. Challenges and Opportunities*. Heidelberg: Springer-Verlag.

Ready, N. P. 2009. *Brooke's Notary* (Thirteenth Edition). London: Thomson Reuters

Robertson, C. 2010. *The Passport in America: The History of a Document*. Oxford University Press.

Robinson, Howard. 2009. Substance. *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Winter 2009 Edition)*, Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL = <http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2009/entries/substance/>.

Roth, Michael S. 1981. Foucault's "History of the Present." *History and Theory.* Vol. 20. No. 1 (Feb., 1981), pp. 32-46

Sassen, Saskia. 2006. *Territory, Authority, Rights: From Medieval to Global Assemblages.* Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Smith, S. J., ed. 2002. *Script and seal use on Cyprus in the Bronze and Iron Ages.* Boston, Mass.: Archaeological Institute of America.

Solove, D. 2007. *The Future of Reputation: Gossip, Rumor, and Privacy on the Internet.* New Haven: Yale University Press.

___ 2006a. "A Model Regime of Privacy Protection." *University of Illinois Law Journal.* Vol. 2006, no. 2.

___ 2006b. "A Taxonomy of Privacy." *University of Pennsylvania Law Review.* Vol. 154, no. 3.

___ 2004. *The Digital Person: Technology and Privacy in the Information Age.* New York: NYU Press.

____ 2003. "Identity Theft, Privacy, and the Architecture of Vulnerability." *Hastings Law Journal* 54. San Francisco, Calif.: Hastings College of Law.

Somers, Margaret R. 1994. The Narrative Constitution of Identity: A Relational and Network Approach. *Theory and Society* vol. 23 no. 5, pp. 605-649.

Somers, Margaret R. 1998. "We're Not Angels": Realism, Rational Choice, and Relationality in Social Science. *The American Journal of Sociology* vol. 104. No. 3 (Nov. 1998), pp. 722-784. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Stanton, J., M. Chango, and J. Owens. 2007. "ICAO and the Biometric RFID Passport: History and Analysis." Paper presented by first author at the Research Workshop on National ID Cards at Queen's University, June 7 – 9, 2007. http://www.sscqueens.org/node/102/#stanton

Strozier, R. M. 2002. *Foucault, Subjectivity, and Identity: Historical Construction of Subject and Self.* Detroit: Wayne State University Press

Sun, Weizu. 2004. *Chinese Seals: Carving Authority and Creating History.* Long River Press

Tilly, C. (ed.). 1975. *The Formation of national States in Western Europe.* Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press.

Tilly, C. 1990. *Coercion, capital, and European states, AD 990-1990.* Cambridge, Mass.: Blackwell.

Tilly, C. 2006. Why and How History Matters. In *The Oxford Handbook of Contextual Political Analysis*, ed. R. E. Goodin and C. Tilly. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 417-437.

Tilly, Charles. 2008. *Explaining Social Processes*. Boulder, CO: Paradigm Publishers

Torpey, John. 2000. *The Invention of the Passport: Surveillance, Citizenship and the State.* New York: Cambridge University Press.

Turkle, Sherry. 1984. *The Second Self: Computers and the Human Spirit*. New York: Simon and Schuster.

Turkle. 1995. *Life on the Screen: Identity in the Age of the Internet*. New York: Touchstone.

Vernant, J.-P., and J. Ker. 1999. "Odysseus in Person." *Representations*, No. 67 (Summer 1999), pp. 1-26

Weber, M. (1919). *Politics as a Vocation*. Available at: http://www.ne.jp/asahi/moriyuki/abukuma/weber/lecture/politics_vocation.html

Weber, M. (1947). *The Theory of Social and Economic Organization*. New York: The Free Press.

Weber, M. 1978 [1922]. *Economy and Society: An Outline of Interpretive Sociology*. Berkeley, Calif.: University of California Press.

Wendt, A. 2001. "Driving with the Rearview Mirror: On the Rational Science of Institutional Design." *International Organization* 55(4): 1019-1049

White, Nicholas P. 1971. "Aristotle on Sameness and Oneness." *The Philosophical Review*, 80(2), pp. 177-197

Wilson, S. 1998. *The Means of Naming: A social and cultural history of personal naming in western Europe*. Bristol, PA: UCL Press.

Windley, P.J. 2005. *Digital Identity*. Sebastopol, Calif.: O'Reilly Media.

Wolter, U. 1997. "The *officium* in Medieval Ecclesiastical Law as a Prototype of Modern Administration." In *Legislation and Justice*, ed. Antonio Padoa-Schoppa. New York: Clarendon Press.

Yin, R. K. 2009. *Case Study Research: Design and Methods*. Washington, D.C.: Sage.

**Archives, Documents and Records**

*Passport*

League of Nations (Provisional Committee on Communications and Transit). 1920. *Conference on Passports, Customs Formalities and Through Tickets: Resolution adopted by the Conference, October 21ˢᵗ 1920*. Paris: League of Nations. Available at http://babel.hathitrust.org/cgi/pt?id=mdp.39015063999380

League of Nations (Advisory and Technical Committee for Communications and Transit). 1922. *Replies of the Governments to the Inquiry on the Application of the Resolutions relating to Passports, Customs Formalities and Through Tickets*. Doc. C.183.M.101.1922.VIII.[3] Geneva: League of Nations.

League of Nations (Advisory and Technical Committee for Communications and Transit). 1925a. *Replies of the Governments to the Questionnaire Regarding Passport Regulations*. Doc. C.405.M.143.1925.VIII. Geneva: League of Nations.

League of Nations (Advisory and Technical Committee for Communications and Transit). 1925b. *Passport Conference, Preparatory Documents, Report Adopted by the Sub-Committee on the Passport Regime in Paris,* October 5, 1925. Doc. C.639.M.218.1925.VIII. Geneva: League of Nations.

League of Nations (Organization for Communication and Transit). 1926. *Passport Conference*. Doc. C. 320.M.119.1926.VIII and Annexes: Doc. C.423.M.156.1926.VIII. Geneva: League of Nations, May 12ᵗʰ to 18ᵗʰ, 1926.

League of Nations. 1927. *Third General Conference on Communications and Transit, Preparatory Documents,* Vol. II and III. Doc. C.558(b).M.200(b).1927.VIII. Geneva: League of Nations, March and November 1927.

League of Nations (Advisory and Technical Committee for Communications and Transit). 1929a. *Action taken by Governments on the Recommendations Adopted by the Second Conference on the International Regime of Passports*. Doc. C.133.M.48.1929.VIII. Geneva: League of Nations.

League of Nations (Advisory and Technical Committee for Communications and Transit). 1929b. *Action taken by Governments on the Recommendations of the Third General Conference on Communications and Transit concerning Identity and Traveling Documents for Persons without Nationality or of Doubtful Nationality*. Doc. C.245.M.84.1929.VIII. Geneva: League of Nations, June 1929.

---

[3] This reference number as well as those of the documents in the rest of this list have been gathered from Turack (1968) and are from the internal referencing of the publishing organization.

League of Nations (Organization for Communications and Transit). 1929c. *European Conference on Cards for Emigrants in Transit*. Doc. C. 326.M.112.1929.VIII. Geneva: League of Nations, June 10th to 14th, 1929.

League of Nations (Advisory and Technical Committee for Communications and Transit). 1937. *Passport System: Replies from Governments*. Doc. C.356.M.241.19375.VIII. Geneva: League of Nations, August 31, 1937.

United Nations, Economic and Social Council. 1947a. *Official Records*. Second Year, 5th Session, Supplement No. 1, 1947. United Nations Doc. E/436 (Recommendations of the Committee of Experts from Geneva meeting, 14-25 April 1947 in the Appendix).

United Nations. 1956. Doc. E/2933, 23 November 1956 and Addenda. United Nations Publication.

United Nations. 1959. Doc. E/CN.2/190, 1 May 1959. United Nations Publication.

United Nations. 1961. Doc. E/3438/Addendum 1, 27 February 1961 and Addenda. United Nations Publication.

United Nations. 1963. *Recommendations on International Travel and Tourism.* Conference on International Travel and Tourism, Rome, 21 August – 5 September 1963. Doc. E/CONF.47/18. United Nations Publication.

United Nations. 1966. *Report of the Secretary-General*. Doc. E/4145, 5 January 1966 and Doc. E/4145/Add.1, 8 June 1966. United Nations Publication.

*Digital Identity: Documents*

Kantara Initiative. 2010. Identity Assurance Framework: Overview. http://kantarainitiative.org, Feb. 26, 2010

Open Identity Exchange. 2010a. The Open Identity Trust Framework (OITF) Model. http://openidentityexchange.org/white-papers, Mar. 2010

____ 2010b. An Open Market Solution for Online Identity Assurance. http://openidentityexchange.org/white-papers, Mar. 2010

____ 2010c. Bylaws of Open Identity Exchange. http://openidentityexchange.org/sites/default/files/oix-bylaws-2010-02-25.pdf

____ 2010d. Trust Framework Provider Assessment Package. http://openidentityexchange.org/, Feb. 12, 2010

____ 2010e. Certificate of Incorporation to Open Identity Exchange. http://openidentityexchange.org/sites/default/files/oix-articles-of-incorporation-2010-02-04.pdf

_____ n. d. Trust Framework Requirements and Guidelines V1 (Draft 01). http://openidentityexchange.org/white-papers

United States Government. 2009. Federal Identity, Credential, and Access Management (FICAM) Roadmap and Implementation Guidance. Federal Chief Information Officers Council and Federal Enterprise Architecture, Nov. 10, 2009

_____ 2009.Trust Framework Provider Adoption Process. http://www.idmanagement.gov, Sep. 4, 2009

_____ 2006. Electronic Authentication Guideline (NIST Special Publication 800-63). NIST, US Department of Commerce, Apr. 2006

_____ 2002. Risk Management Guide for Information Technology Systems (NIST Special Publication 800-30). National Institute of Standards and Technology (NIST), http://csrc.nist.gov/publications/nistpubs/800-30/sp800-30.pdf, July 2002

United States Government (White House). 2011. National Strategy for Trusted Identities in the Cyberspace. http://www.nist.gov/nstic/, Apr. 15, 2011

_____ 2010. National Strategy for Trusted Identities in Cyberspace: Creating Options for Enhanced Online Security and Privacy." Draft, June 25, 2010. http://www.nstic.ideascale.com/

_____ 2009. "Cyberspace Policy Review: Assuring a Trusted and Resilient Information and Communications Infrastructure." May 2009. http://whitehouse.gov/assets/documents/Cyberspace_Policy_Review_final.pdf

_____ 2003. E-authentication Guidance for Federal Agencies (Memorandum M-04-04 to the Heads of all Departments and Agencies). Executive Office of the President, Office of Management and Budget, http://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/omb/memoranda/fy04/m04-04.pdf, Dec. 16, 2003

Brands, S. 2010. "U-Prove Technology Overview." Microsoft Corporation. Available at https://connect.microsoft.com/site642/Downloads/DownloadDetails.aspx?DownloadID= 26953

Brands, S. 2004. "Non-Intrusive Identity Management." Credentica. Available at www.credentica.com

Brands, S. 2003. "Digital Credentials." Credentica. Available at www.credentica.com

Cameron, K. and Jones, M.B. 2006. "Design Rationale behind Identity Metasystem." Microsoft Corporation. Retrieved on Oct. 8, 2006 from: http://www.identityblog.com/wp-content/resources/design_rationale.pdf

Cameron, Kim. 2005. "The Laws of Identity. Microsoft Corporation." Retrieved on Oct. 8, 2006 from: http://www.identityblog.com/stories/2005/05/13/TheLawsOfIdentity.pdf

Chappell, David. 2006. "Introducing Windows CardSpace." April 2006. Retrieved from http://msdn.microsoft.com/en-us/library/aa480189.aspx

Credentica. 2007. "U-Prove SDK Overview: A Crdentica White Paper." Credentica Inc. Retrieved at www.credentica.com

Microsoft. 2005. "Microsoft's Vision for an Identity Metasystem." Microsoft Corporation. Retrieved on Oct. 8, 2006 from: http://www.identityblog.com/stories/2005/10/06/IdentityMetasystem.pdf, and available as of 2/5/2012 at http://msdn.microsoft.com/en-us/library/ms996422.aspx

Paquin, C. 2011. "U-Prove Technology Overview V 1.1: Draft Revision 1." Microsoft Corporation. Available at http://connect.microsoft.com/site1188/Downloads/DownloadDetails.aspx?DownloadID=33918

*Digital Identity: Websites and electronic records*

OASIS, Identity Metasystem Interoperability, Technical Committee webpage: http://www.oasis-open.org/committees/tc_home.php?wg_abbrev=imi

Blog by Kim Cameron: http://www.identityblog/

Blog by Eve Maler: http://blogs.forrester.com/eve_maler

Blog by Dick Hardt: http://www.identity20.com

Blog (Technometria) by Phil Windley: http://www.windley.com

Liberty Alliance project: http://www.projectliberty.org/

Credentica: http://www.credentica.com

Google Identity Research: http://sites.google.com/site/oauthgoog/

Google OAuth & Federated Login Research: http://oauthgoog.blogspot.com/

Kantara Initiative: http://kantarainitiative.org/

FICAM: http://www.idmanagement.gov/

Information Card Foundation: http://informationcard.net/

OAuth resource website and blog by Eran Hammer: http://hueniverse.com/

OpenID Foundation: http://openid.net/

Windows CardSpace: http://msdn.microsoft.com/en-us/library/ms733090(v=vs.85).aspx

## *Other Documents*

U. S. Federal Trade Commission. 2007. *Consumer Fraud and Identity Theft Complaint Data.* January – December 2006 Report. http://www.ftc.gov/opa/2007/02/topcomplaints.shtm

U. S. Federal Trade Commission. 2008. *Consumer Fraud and Identity Theft Complaint Data.* January – December 2007 Report. http://www.ftc.gov/opa/2008/02/fraud.pdf

U. S. Federal Trade Commission. 2010. *Consumer Sentinel Data Book: From January to December 2009.* http://www.ftc.gov/sentinel/reports/sentinel-annual-reports/sentinel-cy2009.pdf.

Internet Crime Complaint Center, IC3. 2010. *2009 Internet Crime Report.* See http://www.ic3.gov/media/annualreports.aspx

## *Interviews*

…